

Message

From: LEE, LILY [LEE.LILY@EPA.GOV]
Sent: 10/24/2017 4:23:26 PM
To: Herrera, Angeles [Herrera.Angeles@epa.gov]
CC: Chesnutt, John [Chesnutt.John@epa.gov]
Subject: Summary - EPA draft review of Parcel G Trench Units in draft Radiological Data Evaluation Findings Report
Attachments: Parcel G CDPH EPA Review Building sites -10-20-2017 to Navy .xlsx; Parcel G EPA Supplemental Statistical Analyses.pdf; Draft EPA comments on draft Rad Data Eval Parcel G V1 10-20-2017 - cover note.doc; Draft EPA comments on draft Rad Data Eval Parcel G V1 10-20-2017 Narrative.docx; Parcel G NFA TU067_to_TU204 EPA Review 10-20-2017 to Navy.xlsx; Parcel G Regulators Review Summary Trench Fill Bldg 10-20-2017.xlsx

Dear Angeles,

Since John is out, I wanted to make sure to keep you in the loop on the technical comments we just sent the Navy (below and attached). Once we added our reviews to the Navy's, the total trench units recommended for resampling rose to 94%. When combined with fill units and building site survey units, the total overall for Parcel G rose to 97%. The last spreadsheet attached ("Regulators Review") summarizes the numbers. We are not working on Parcel B, which we would not expect to have as many problems because it had less history of radiological work and because work was done earlier than the time frame of many of the allegations.

I ran into Enrique in the hallway yesterday and let him know. He asked me draft a brief email for him to send to Laura as followup reinforcement.

The attached language was approved by John and Brianna. The review comments come from them as well as Jackie, David (HQ ERT health physicist), a Techlaw health physicist, and Karla (Techlaw geologist).

Please let me know if you want to talk about anything in John's absence.

- Lily

Last week, EPA and state DTSC sent comments on Parcel G of the Navy's radiological data evaluation of Tetra Tech EC, Inc., former work at Hunters Point Naval Shipyard. Parcel G is the next one the City wants to redevelop. It has a known history of previous radiological contamination. Much of the work in this parcel occurred during years that former workers alleged wrongdoing. The Navy reviewed available data, found evidence of potential falsification and proposed resampling in nearly half of the trench, building site, and fill units. Regulatory agencies reviewed the draft findings and found more areas of concern and recommended most of the remaining half for resampling in addition for a total of 97% of trench, fill, and building site units recommended for resampling (see attached summary spreadsheet). We also sent the Navy and City the attached detailed spreadsheet of EPA's analysis and justification for technical recommendations.

The State Department of Toxic Substances Control (DTSC) and EPA have concurred on one another's recommendations for the needs for additional sampling in these units. The California Department of Public Health (CDPH) is drafting its comment letter, expected to arrive early this week.

We will continue technical review of evidence from other Parcels. They each have unique circumstances and may have greater or lesser degree of associated concern.

Attached is the narrative of EPA comments. Below is an excerpt.

"Together, the EPA and the Navy found enough concerns to recommend resampling in 94% of trench units in Parcel G. The data analyzed demonstrate a widespread pattern of practices that appeared to show potential deliberate falsification, potential failure to perform the work required to ensure ROD requirements were met, or

both. The data revealed not only potential purposeful falsification and fraud in terms of sample and/or data manipulation, they also reveal the potential failure to conduct adequate scans, a lack of proper chain of custody for ensuring samples were not tampered with, extensive data quality issues (including off-site laboratory data) and general mis-management of the entire characterization and cleanup project.”

“These observations in the record call into question the performance of Tetra Tech EC, Inc., across all of Parcel G. Many of the same personnel in Tetra Tech EC, Inc., worked in a similar time period at nearby locations in Parcel G. The pervasiveness and magnitude of the documented wrongdoing makes it difficult to conclude that similar falsification did not also occur at the four out of 63 trench units where evidence of wrongdoing was not as apparent. Therefore, none of the data generated while Tetra Tech EC, Inc., was involved with the cleanup activities at Parcel G, can be deemed to be definitive or defensible. Therefore, the extent of the problems found in Tetra Tech EC, Inc., work and the history of contamination confirmed in Parcel G (see examples listed in the cover letter) make comprehensive rework for characterization, and potential additional cleanup, necessary to demonstrate in the record that ROD requirements have been met.

Forwarded:

Dear Pat,

Thank you for providing for review the *Draft Radiological Data Evaluation Findings Report for Parcels B and G Soil* (“Report”), Former Hunter’s Point Naval Shipyard, September 2017. I appreciate it represents a great deal of hard work in a short time by a credentialed team. The Navy has requested an expedited review of the Report. In response to the Navy’s request for updates on review progress in stages, EPA is providing the following interim draft review comments in advance of a full review:

1. Cover Letter
2. Draft narrative comments on the Report’s main text and describing EPA’s reviews of the Navy’s draft forms and data.
3. Spreadsheet for Parcel G Trench Unit giving detailed EPA review findings. The second tab shows an overall summary of scores.
4. Spreadsheet for Parcel G Building site survey units giving detailed CDPH and EPA review findings
5. Supplemental statistical analyses for individual trench units

Please contact me at 415-947-4187 or lee.lily@epa.gov if you would like to discuss any of these interim draft comments.

Lily Lee

Cleanup Project Manager

Superfund Division

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 9

75 Hawthorne St. (SFD-8-3)

San Francisco, CA 94105

Tel: 415-947-4187, Fax: 415-947-3518

For information on Superfund in general: www.epa.gov/region9/superfund

For information on Hunters Point Naval Shipyard: www.epa.gov/superfund/hunterspoint